

Application No: 15/3134M

Location: CHORLEY OLD HALL, CHORLEY HALL CLOSE, ALDERLEY EDGE, WILMSLOW, CHESHIRE, SK9 7TG

Proposal: Listed Building Consent for Part single storey and part two storey extension; external and internal alterations; new landscaping

Applicant: Mr & Mrs J Johnson

Expiry Date: 04-Sep-2015

Date Report Prepared: 22 September 2015

SUMMARY

This application is a Listed Building Consent for the replacement of an existing single storey extension with a new two storey extension, together with minor alterations elsewhere to the grade I listed building and Scheduled Monument. Following extensive discussions with Historic England and the Council's Conservation Officer it was decided that the proposal is appropriate in design, scale and massing and the alterations involved have been acceptably justified, in terms of the benefits of sustaining the residential use of the listed building.

The proposed development complies with the relevant development plan policies and is considered to be sustainable in the social, environmental and economic context. The application is therefore recommended for approval.

REASON FOR REPORT

This application has been called in to committee at the request of Cllr Craig Browne on the 31st July due to concerns raised in respect to the proposed:

- Chorley Old Hall is a Grade I listed building and as such is of significant value to the architectural heritage of Alderley Edge. It is also one of the oldest (if not the oldest) buildings within the community;
- Alderley Edge Parish Council has considered the application and is of the view that the proposed materials (particularly modern timber and glazing) are incompatible with the historic design & finish of the original building;
- The Parish Council also feel that the heritage value of the building is so great, that it is of significance to the wider borough and that the proposals should therefore not be determined by an individual officer.

DESCRIPTION OF SITE AND CONTEXT

Chorley Old Hall is a grade I listed building and Scheduled Monument of exceptional historic, architectural and archaeological significance. The building is an example of a 14C medieval hall, retaining the majority of its open hall and screens passage structure.

The site is located on the outskirts of Alderley Edge in an area of Green Belt.

DETAILS OF PROPOSAL

Listed Building Consent is sought for the following:

- Demolition of the existing single storey extension and construction of a new two storey extension on the same site but to a larger footprint.
- Carry out internal alterations at ground floor level within the Hall including:
 - Honed Yorkstone paving to be laid in the extension and family entrance lobby
 - The existing stone flag floor at ground floor level of the stair enclosure is to be carefully lifted and re-laid
 - The existing floor finishes within the Kitchen are to be carefully removed down to the level of the existing Yorkstone flags.
 - The existing floor finishes in the Dining Hall, and the slab beneath, are to be carefully removed for investigation purposes finished with new honed Yorkstone flags at the same level as the existing.
 - The existing stone flag floors within the Main Entrance Lobby and Screens Passage are to be carefully lifted and re-laid.
 - The existing Yorkstone flags to the southern path and west terrace are to be carefully lifted and set aside for re-use elsewhere. The step structures, raised planter and wall between the south path and lawn are to be carefully dismantled down to the top of the footings with all materials retained and set aside for re-use.
 - Contemporary lantern style light fittings are to be installed at or over the Family Entrance.
 - The half brick partition between the Kitchen and Dining Hall is to be carefully dismantled from the King mullion on the north side to the south side of the existing door opening. The bricks would be cut out and removed by hand
 - Replacement fireplace separate bread oven.
 - The existing Kitchen units are to be removed and replaced by new units with simple panelled doors with a hand-painted finish and granite worktops.
- Carry out essential maintenance on the external building fabric and courtyard area.
- Implement a new landscaping scheme to the south and west of the Hall.

RELEVANT HISTORY

97/2331P PROVISION OF NEW GROUND FLOOR WINDOW IN WEST ELEVATION
Approved with conditions 17 February 1998

22911P DEMOLITION OF + ERECTION OF NEW SUNLOUNGE + NEW DOUBLE
GARAGE
Approved with conditions 21 July 1980

POLICIES

Macclesfield Borough Local Plan – saved policies

BE1 (Design principles for new developments)
BE2 (Preservation of the historic environment)
BE15 (Repair or enhancement (listed buildings))
BE18 (Alteration extensions and partial demolition (listed buildings))
BE21 (Sites of Archaeological Importance)
BE22 (Scheduled Monuments)
BE23 (Development affecting Archaeological Sites)

The saved Local Plan policies are consistent with the NPPF and should be given full weight.

Other Material Considerations

National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF)
National Planning Practice Framework (NPPG)

National Policy:

The National Planning Policy Framework establishes a presumption in favour of sustainable development.

Of particular relevance is paragraph 12.

Cheshire East Local Plan Strategy – Submission Version (CELP)

The following are considered relevant material considerations as indications of the emerging strategy:

MP1 (Presumption in Favour of Sustainable Development)
SD1 (Sustainable Development in Cheshire East)
SD2 (Sustainable Development Principles)
SE1 (Design)
SE7 (the historic environment)

CONSULTATIONS (External to Planning)

Archaeology: no objections subject to condition

Conservation: no objections

VIEWS OF THE PARISH / TOWN COUNCIL

Alderley Edge Parish Council: no specific comments have been received from the parish council, however comments from Cllr Browne in the call-in request mention 'Alderley Edge Parish Council has considered the application and is of the view that the proposed materials (particularly modern timber and glazing) are incompatible with the historic design & finish of the original building'.

OTHER REPRESENTATIONS

None

APPLICANT'S SUPPORTING INFORMATION

The applicant has submitted a Planning Statement, an Archaeological Evaluation and Heritage Impact. Details of these can be viewed on the electronic file.

OFFICER APPRAISAL

Key Issues

- Impact of the proposal on the architectural and historic integrity of the listed building

Design/impact on the Listed Building

Chorley Old Hall is a Grade 1 , 14th century medieval Hall and also a scheduled monument, access to the moated site is via a grade II listed Bridge. The building has evolved and these changes are clearly visible both internally and externally. The various phases of development show the chronology of the Hall as it has passed through different ownership and phases of fashion and architectural style and technique. These are an important part of the significance of the Hall and considered an important part of the buildings special interest. The existing 20th century family room is considered to be of no heritage value, the principle of its loss is considered acceptable. The main issue is the effect of the extension on the architectural and historic interest of the Hall.

Discussions have been ongoing between the Council's Conservation Officer, the owners, architect, and Historic England for approx. 4 years relating to the replacement of the existing 20th century extension. During this time a number of design concepts have been explored along with detailed investigations and surveys and constant dialogue has been had between Historic England, our Conservation Officer and the architect to amend the design and arrive at a suitable concept all parties consider to be appropriate to the highly significant and sensitive building. Early stages included extensive surveying, understanding the building showing the scheme has very much been conservation led and informed.

The extension is lesser in width than the two existing rear gabled elements of the Hall. The recessed glazing will separate the Hall from the new extension, but will sit in alignment to the rear elevation and west elevation walls, filling the corner between the two. This relationship is fundamental for an extension to a listed building in order to preserve the integrity of the original plan form of the building. The areas where the most amendments have taken place during the design stage relate to the architectural detailing of fenestration and details such as the link and corner post to the extension. The extension is clearly a contemporary extension to a historic building, the set back of the glazed link between the extension and the Hall retains the original plan form. The building would be built off foundations above the level of below-ground archaeology which is known to exist in order to avoid disturbance.

The following comments were made by our Conservation Officer:

'the proposed extension is subservient in scale and respectful of the plan form of the building, using high quality materials and sensitive construction (which is to be controlled by condition through the scheduled monument consent and construction method statement) which will not compete with the historic fabric and architectural language of the Hall but will not dominate or compete due to its simple palette of materials and the light weight design. In future years, it will be possible to differentiate between the building as it was in the 14th century and later phases, from the extension built in the early 21st century. The extension is a contrasting but lightweight contemporary design. The Hall's western gable will remain visible and will require minimal alteration and demolition of the staircase to accommodate the new extension. The existing staircase will not be tied to the extension so will remain an independent and not altered by the changes; it is therefore a reversible change with minimal impact upon the historic fabric, covering areas of the Hall presently covered by the existing extension. The building has a history of additions, all of which were contemporary in their day and different from the original, the changes offered modern building techniques and another chapter of change; this is one such change to the buildings history. Regarding the setting of the Hall, The NPPF makes it clear that the setting of a heritage asset is the surroundings in which a heritage asset is experienced. Its extent is not fixed and may change as the asset and its surroundings evolve. Elements of a setting may make a positive or negative contribution to the significance of an asset, may affect the ability to appreciate that significance or may be neutral (NPPF glossary). (Guidance note 3-Setting; Historic England). It is not considered for the reasons mentioned above there will be any harm to the setting of the Hall.

Section 66 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 requires that in considering whether to grant planning permission for development which affects a listed building or its setting, the local planning authority or, as the case may be, the Secretary of State shall have special regard to the desirability of preserving the building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses. Paragraphs 132 and 134 consider the harm which may be caused arising from development proposals and must be weighed against the public benefit.

I consider the scheme is acceptable in terms of the impact on the significance of the Grade I listed Hall and will be in line with statutory duty, the NPPF and local plan policy BE15 and BE16.'

This support is reiterated in the response of the Historic England Officer with the following comments; *'The proposed design is appropriated in design, scale and massing and the alterations involved have been acceptably justified, in terms of the benefits of sustaining the residential use of the listed building. We therefore have no objection to the proposals.'*

It is clear that the proposal deals with the physical intervention with the listed building in a sensitive way. Notwithstanding the comments from the conservation officer and Historic England, it is clear that the proposal is a bold solution and it must be recognised that different opinions may be held about the acceptability of this form of extension to the building. On balance, taking into account the comments that have come forward from the specialists in this field, it is considered that the extension will have an acceptable impact on the Listed Building and complies with policy in terms of the impact on the building and its setting.

Concerns are raised as to the restrictive nature of the site and the Grade II listed bridge so it is considered appropriate to condition a method statement.

The materials finish to the extension is a critical element. Ideally, officers would like to see a sample of finished stone on site prior to the granting of planning permission. The applicant is working to source the best possible stone for the extension and members will be updated on this issue. Given the importance of the materials to the overall impact of the extension, if this matter has not been resolved prior to the planning committee, it is recommended that this aspect is delegated to officers, in consultation with the Chair and Vice-Chair, to ensure satisfactory materials are viewed on site prior to planning permission being granted.

CONCLUSIONS AND REASON(S) FOR THE DECISION

The proposed development follows extensive discussions between Historic England, the applicants and the Council's Conservation Officer which have led to a positive recommendation from both consultees. With this in mind the proposal is considered to, on balance, have an acceptable impact on the Listed Building. The proposal accords with all relevant Development Plan policies and is deemed to be a sustainable form of development. As such, in accordance with para 14 of the NPPF, the proposal should be approved without delay. Therefore, subject to the receipt of outstanding consultation comments, a recommendation of approval is made subject to conditions.

RECOMMENDATION

The application is recommended for approval.

In order to give proper effect to the Committee's intentions and without changing the substance of the decision, authority is delegated to the Planning and Enforcement Manager, in consultation with the Chairman (or in his absence the Vice Chair) of Northern Planning Committee to correct any technical slip or omission in the wording of the resolution, between approval of the minutes and issue of the decision notice.

Application for Listed Building Consent

RECOMMENDATION:

1. A02LB Method statement
2. A07LB Standard Time Limit
3. A01AP Development in accord with approved plans
4. Materials as submitted

